

Appeal Docket Sheet**Superior Court of Pennsylvania****Docket Number: 993 EDA 2024****Page 1 of 11****May 12, 2025****CAPTION**

Ernest Caranci and Carmela Caranci

v.

Monsanto Company, Bayer AG, S&H Hardward and Supply Company, Penn Hardward, Inc., Penn Hardware Two, Inc.

Appeal of: Monsanto Company

CASE INFORMATION

Initiating Document: Notice of Appeal

Case Status: Decided/Active

Case Processing Status: May 8, 2025 Awaiting Remittal

Journal Number: J-A06036-25

Case Category: Civil Case Type(s): Products Liability

CONSOLIDATED CASES**RELATED CASES**

Docket No / Reason

Type

1259 EDA 2024
Similar Issue(s)

Related

1260 EDA 2024
Similar Issue(s)

Related

1845 EDA 2024
Similar Issue(s)

Related

SCHEDULED EVENT

Next Event Type: Record Remitted

Next Event Due Date: June 9, 2025

COUNSEL INFORMATION**Appellant Monsanto Company**

Pro Se: No

IFP Status: No

Attorney: Miller, Chanda Ann
 Law Firm: Barnes & Thornburg LLP
 Address: 1717 Arch St Ste 4900
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (445) 201-8900

Fax No:

Attorney: Hare, John Jacob
 Law Firm: Marshall Dennehey, P.C.
 Address: Marshall Dennehey Pc
 2000 Market St Ste 2300
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 575-2609

Fax No:

Appeal Docket Sheet

Superior Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 993 EDA 2024

Page 2 of 11

May 12, 2025



COUNSEL INFORMATION

Appellant **Monsanto Company**

Pro Se: No

IFP Status: No

Attorney: Heim, Robert C.
 Law Firm: Dechert LLP
 Address: Cira Centre
 2929 Arch St
 Philadelphia, PA 19104-2808
 Phone No: (215) 994-4000 Fax No: (215) 994-2222

Attorney: Leffler, Erin Loucks
 Law Firm: Shook Hardy & Bacon L.L.P.
 Address: 2001 Market St Ste 3000
 Philadelphia, PA 19103
 Phone No: (215) 278-2555 Fax No:

Attorney: Penza, Moira
 Address: Wilkinson Stekloff, LLP
 130 West 42nd Street
 24th Floor
 New York, NY 10036

Attorney: Cachan, Manuel F.
 Law Firm: Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom, LLP
 Address: Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom, LLP
 300 South Grand Avenue
 Los Angeles, CA 90071

Attorney: Zions, David M.
 Address: Covington & Burling, LLP
 One City Center
 850 Tenth Street
 Washington, DC 20001
 Phone No: (202) 662-6000 Fax No:
 Mobile No: (202) 662-6000

Amicus **United Farm Workers et al.**

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: McPhedran, Charles
 Address: 1617 JFK Boulevard #2020
 Philadelphia, PA 19103

Appeal Docket Sheet

Superior Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 993 EDA 2024

Page 3 of 11

May 12, 2025



COUNSEL INFORMATION

Appellee Caranci and Carmela Caranci, Ernest

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Kline, Thomas R.
 Address: Kline & Specter Pc
 1525 Locust St Fl 19
 Philadelphia, PA 19102-3700
 Phone No: (215) 772-1360 Fax No:

Attorney: Millrood, Tobias Lael
 Law Firm: Kline & Specter, P.C.
 Address: Kline & Specter P.c.
 1525 Locust St 19th Fl
 Philadelphia, PA 19102
 Phone No: (215) 772-1358 Fax No:

Attorney: Becker, Charles Lyman
 Law Firm: Kline & Specter, PC
 Address: Kline & Specter Pc
 1525 Locust St 19th Fl
 Philadelphia, PA 19102
 Phone No: (215) 772-1000 Fax No:

Attorney: Itkin, Jason A.
 Law Firm: Arnold & Itkin LLP
 Address: 6009 Memorial Dr
 Houston, TX 77007-7035
 Phone No: (713) 222-3850 Fax No:

Attorney: Arnold, Kurt Brynilde
 Law Firm: Arnold & Itkin LLP
 Address: 6009 Memorial Dr
 Houston, TX 77007
 Phone No: (713) 222-3800 Fax No:

Attorney: Laidacker, Ruxandra Maniu
 Law Firm: Kline & Specter, PC
 Address: Kline & Specter
 1525 Locust St Fl 19
 Philadelphia, PA 19102
 Phone No: (215) 772-1452 Fax No:

Attorney: Wexler, Noah Michael
 Law Firm: Arnold & Itkin LLP
 Address: 6009 Memorial Dr
 Houston, TX 77007
 Phone No: (713) 222-3800 Fax No:

Appeal Docket Sheet

Superior Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 993 EDA 2024

Page 4 of 11

May 12, 2025



COUNSEL INFORMATION

Appellee Caranci and Carmela Caranci, Ernest

Pro Se: No

IFP Status:

Attorney: Merk, Melissa A.
 Law Firm: Kline & Specter, P.C.
 Address: Kline & Specter Pc
 1525 Locust St
 Philadelphia, PA 19102
 Phone No: (215) 772-1000

Fax No:

Attorney: Christensen, Roland
 Law Firm: Arnold & Itkin LLP
 Address: 6009 Memorial Dr
 Houston, TX 77007
 Phone No: (713) 222-3800

Fax No:

FEE INFORMATION

Fee Dt	Fee Name	Fee Amt	Receipt Dt	Receipt No	Receipt Amt
03/27/2024	Notice of Appeal	90.25	04/10/2024	2024-SPR-E-000519	90.25
10/14/2024	2nd Motion for Extension of Time	10.00	10/15/2024	2024-SPR-E-001439	10.00

AGENCY/TRIAL COURT INFORMATION

Order Appealed From: March 11, 2024 Notice of Appeal Filed: March 27, 2024
 Order Type: Judgment Entered
 Documents Received: April 10, 2024

Court Below: Philadelphia County Court of Common Pleas
 County: Philadelphia Division: Philadelphia County Civil Division
 Judge: Crumlish, James C., III OTN:
 Docket Number: 210602213 Judicial District: 01

ORIGINAL RECORD CONTENT

Original Record Item	Filed Date	Content Description
Testimony	April 15, 2024	
Original Record	May 28, 2024	
Original Record	May 28, 2024	
Trial Court Opinion	May 28, 2024	
Trial Court Opinion	May 28, 2024	
Exhibit(s)	May 29, 2024	
Trial Court Opinion	June 07, 2024	
Supplemental Record	December 19, 2024	

Date of Remand of Record:

BRIEFING SCHEDULE

Amicus

United Farm Workers et al.

Brief

Due: January 28, 2025

Filed: January 28, 2025

Appellee

Caranci and Carmela Caranci, Ernest

Brief

Due: November 1, 2024

Filed: November 1, 2024

Due: December 30, 2024

Filed: December 30, 2024

Appellant

Appeal Docket Sheet**Superior Court of Pennsylvania****Docket Number: 993 EDA 2024****Page 5 of 11****May 12, 2025****BRIEFING SCHEDULE****Appellant****Monsanto Company****Brief**

Due: August 19, 2024

Filed: August 19, 2024

Due: December 30, 2024

Filed: December 30, 2024

Reply Brief

Due: December 9, 2024

Filed: December 9, 2024

Due: December 30, 2024

Filed: December 30, 2024

Due: February 21, 2025

Filed: February 21, 2025

Reproduced Record

Due: December 16, 2024

Filed: December 16, 2024

DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
April 10, 2024	Notice of Appeal Docketed	Appellant	Monsanto Company
	Comment: Case Type: Mass Tort		
April 10, 2024	Docketing Statement Exited (Civil)		Superior Court of Pennsylvania
April 15, 2024	Transcripts of Testimony		Court Reporters, Digital Recording, and Interpreters Administration - First Judicial District of Pennsylvania
April 24, 2024	Docketing Statement Received (Civil)	Appellant	Monsanto Company
April 24, 2024	Other	Appellant	Monsanto Company
	Comment: Attachment to Docketing Statement		
May 28, 2024	Trial Court Record Received		Philadelphia County Civil Division
May 28, 2024	Sealed Trial Court Record Received - Sensitive Documents		Philadelphia County Civil Division
May 28, 2024	Trial Court Opinion Received		Philadelphia County Civil Division
May 28, 2024	Trial Court Opinion Received		Philadelphia County Civil Division
May 28, 2024	Briefing Schedule Issued		Superior Court of Pennsylvania
May 29, 2024	Exhibits		Philadelphia County Civil Division

Appeal Docket Sheet

Superior Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 993 EDA 2024

Page 6 of 11

May 12, 2025



DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
June 7, 2024	Trial Court Opinion Received		Philadelphia County Civil Division
June 7, 2024	Application for Extension of Time to File Brief - First Request	Appellant	Monsanto Company
June 7, 2024	Notice to Defer Preparation of Reproduced Record Pursuant to Pa.R.A.P. 2154b	Appellant	Monsanto Company
June 7, 2024	Order Granting Application for Extension of Time to File Appellant Brief		Per Curiam
	Comment: Briefs are due 8/19/2024.		
June 26, 2024	Order		Per Curiam
	<p>Comment: Upon review of the June 7, 2024 "Notice of Election by Appellant Monsanto Company to Designate the Contents of the Record Pursuant to Pa.R.A.P. 2154(b)," filed by Appellant's counsel, the following is hereby ORDERED:</p> <p>The proof of service of Appellant's Advance Text Brief is due in this Court on or before August 19, 2024.</p> <p>The proof of service of Appellee's Advance Text Brief shall then be due in this Court within thirty (30) days of Appellant's proof of service of its Advance Text Brief.</p> <p>The reproduced record shall then be due in this Court within twenty-one (21) days of Appellee's proof of service of his Advance Text Brief. See Pa.R.A.P. 2186(a)(2).</p> <p>The Parties' Definitive Briefs shall be due in this Court within fourteen (14) days of the filing of the reproduced record. See Pa.R.A.P. 2185(c). Failure to comply with these due dates may result in sua sponte actions by this Court, including, but not limited to, dismissal of the appeal or preclusion from oral argument.</p>		
August 16, 2024	Entry of Appearance - Private Monsanto Company	Appellant	Heim, Robert C.
August 16, 2024	Entry of Appearance - Private Monsanto Company	Appellant	Hare, John Jacob
August 16, 2024	Application to be Admitted Pro Hac Vice Monsanto Company	Appellant	Miller, Chanda Ann
August 19, 2024	Appellant's Brief Filed	Appellant	Monsanto Company
	Document Name: PROOF OF SERVICE OF APPELLANT MONSANTO COMPANY'S		
	Comment: ADVANCE TEXT		

Appeal Docket Sheet

Superior Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 993 EDA 2024

Page 7 of 11

May 12, 2025



DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
August 20, 2024	Reply Letter(s) Printed		Santarelli, Letitia
August 21, 2024	Reply Received (Argument)	Appellant	Monsanto Company
August 28, 2024	Paper Version of PACFiled Document Received	Appellant	Monsanto Company
	Document Name: PROOF OF SERVICE OF APPELLANT		
September 9, 2024	Order Granting Application to be Admitted Pro Hac Vice		Per Curiam
	Comment: Upon consideration of the August 16, 2024 "Motion for Admission Pro Hac Vice of David M. Zionts, Esquire," docketed as "Application to be Admitted Pro Hac Vice," filed by sponsor Chanda A. Miller, Esquire, counsel for Appellant, Monsanto Company, on behalf of David M. Zionts, Esquire, the application is GRANTED.		
September 12, 2024	Application for Extension of Time to File Brief - First Request	Appellee	Caranci and Carmela Caranci, Ernest
September 13, 2024	Order Granting Application for Extension of Time to File Appellee Brief		Per Curiam
	Comment: Briefs are due 10/18/2024.		
September 13, 2024	Entry of Appearance - Private Caranci and Carmela Caranci, Ernest	Appellee	Laidacker, Ruxandra Maniu
October 14, 2024	Application for Extension of Time to File Brief - Second Request	Appellee	Caranci and Carmela Caranci, Ernest
October 15, 2024	Order Granting Application for Extension of Time to File Appellee Brief		Per Curiam
	Comment: Granted until November 1, 2024.		
November 1, 2024	Notice of Service of Advance Form Brief	Appellee	Caranci and Carmela Caranci, Ernest
	Comment: proof of service		
November 8, 2024	Application for Extension of Time to File Reply Brief	Appellant	Monsanto Company

Appeal Docket Sheet

Superior Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 993 EDA 2024

Page 8 of 11

May 12, 2025



DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
December 2, 2024	Order		Per Curiam
	Comment: Upon consideration of the November 8, 2024 "Unopposed First Application for Extension of Time to File Reply Brief, Reproduced Record, and Definitive Copies of the Parties' Briefs," filed by counsel on behalf of Appellant Monsanto, the application is hereby GRANTED as follows: Appellant's Reply Brief shall be due in this Court on or before December 9, 2024. The reproduced record shall be due in this Court on or before December 16, 2024. The Parties' Definitive Briefs shall be due in this Court on or before December 30, 2024. No further extensions will be granted, and failure to comply with these due dates may result in sua sponte actions by this Court, including, but not limited to, dismissal of the appeal or preclusion from oral argument.		
December 9, 2024	Appellant's Reply Brief	Appellant	Monsanto Company
	Document Name: Advance Text Copy Comment: PROOF OF SERVICE OF APPELLANT MONSANTO COMPANY'S ADVANCE TEXT OF REPLY BRIEF		
December 16, 2024	Reproduced Record Filed	Appellant	Monsanto Company
	Comment: Vol. I, II, & III		
December 16, 2024	Sealed Application to File Under Seal	Appellant	Monsanto Company
December 18, 2024	Notice of Overdue Paper Copies		Santarelli, Letitia
December 19, 2024	Supplemental Record Filed		Philadelphia County Civil Division
December 23, 2024	Order Granting Application to File Under Seal		Per Curiam
	Comment: Upon consideration of the December 16, 2024 "Uncontested Application of Appellant Monsanto Company to File Parts of the Reproduced Record Under Seal," docketed as "Application to File Under Seal," filed by Appellant, Monsanto Company, the application is GRANTED. The Prothonotary of this Court is DIRECTED to place under seal "Reproduced Record Volume IV of IV" filed with this Court on December 16, 2024.		
December 23, 2024	Paper Version of PACFiled Document Received	Appellant	Monsanto Company
	Document Name: RRF		
December 30, 2024	Appellee's Brief Filed	Appellee	Caranci and Carmela Caranci, Ernest
	Document Name: Definitive Brief		

Appeal Docket Sheet

Superior Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 993 EDA 2024

Page 9 of 11

May 12, 2025



DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
December 30, 2024	Appellant's Brief Filed	Appellant	Monsanto Company
	Document Name: Definitive Brief		
December 30, 2024	Appellant's Reply Brief	Appellant	Monsanto Company
	Document Name: Definitive Reply Brief		
December 30, 2024	Paper Version of PACFiled Document Received	Appellee	Caranci and Carmela Caranci, Ernest
	Document Name: appellee definitive brief		
January 3, 2025	Paper Version of PACFiled Document Received	Appellant	Monsanto Company
	Document Name: Advance Text Copy - Appellant Reply Brief		
January 8, 2025	Paper Version of PACFiled Document Received	Appellant	Monsanto Company
	Document Name: RPBRF - Definitive brief		
January 8, 2025	Paper Version of PACFiled Document Received	Appellant	Monsanto Company
	Document Name: TBRF - Definitive Brief		
January 16, 2025	Argument Letter Sent		Superior Court of Pennsylvania
January 16, 2025	Acknowledgement of Argument Notice Caranci and Carmela Caranci, Ernest	Appellee	Becker, Charles Lyman
January 24, 2025	Application for Leave to File Amicus Brief	Amicus	McPhedran, Charles
January 27, 2025	Acknowledgement of Argument Notice Monsanto Company	Appellant	Hare, John Jacob
January 28, 2025	Order Granting Application for Leave to File Amicus Brief		Per Curiam
	Comment: AND NOW, we hereby grant the United Farm Workers, California Rural Legal Assistance Foundation, Farmworker Justice, Migrant Clinicians Network, and Pesticide Action Network North Americas' Application for Leave to file an Amicus Brief in Support of Plaintiff-Appellee, Ernest Caranci.		
January 28, 2025	Amicus Curiae Brief	Amicus	United Farm Workers et al.
January 30, 2025	Paper Version of PACFiled Document Received	Amicus	McPhedran, Charles
	Document Name: Amicus Brief		

Appeal Docket Sheet

Superior Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 993 EDA 2024

Page 10 of 11

May 12, 2025



DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
January 30, 2025	Application to Strike	Appellant	Monsanto Company
	Comment: APPLICATION TO STRIKE AMICUS BRIEF IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFF-APPELLEE OR, IN THE ALTERNATIVE, FOR LEAVE TO REPLY.		
February 3, 2025	Acknowledgement of Argument Notice Monsanto Company	Appellant	Heim, Robert C.
February 7, 2025	Order Denying Application to Strike		Per Curiam
	Comment: AND NOW, we hereby deny Appellant Monsanto Company's "Application to Strike Amicus Brief in Support of Plaintiff-Appellee" and grant them leave to reply to said Amicus Brief, within 14 days of the date of this order.		
February 21, 2025	Appellant's Reply Brief	Appellant	Monsanto Company
	Comment: REPLY TO AMICUS BRIEF OF UNITED FARMWORKERS, ET AL.		
February 21, 2025	Application for Relief	Appellee	Caranci and Carmela Caranci, Ernest
	Comment: MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE SUPPLEMENTAL AUTHORITY		
February 25, 2025	Paper Version of PACFiled Document Received	Appellant	Monsanto Company
	Document Name: RPBRF		
March 3, 2025	Order		Per Curiam
	Comment: Argument in this matter is continued due to the illness of a one of the Judge's family members.		
	A further order will follow.		
	The prothonotary is directed to remove this case from the argument list.		
	Panel jurisdiction retained.		
March 14, 2025	Order		Per Curiam
	Comment: And Now, this 14th day of March, 2025:		
	Oral Argument is scheduled for March 27, 2025, at 1:00 p.m., at the Superior Court Courtroom, 17th Floor, 530 Walnut Street, Philadelphia, PA 19106.		
	The Prothonotary of the Superior Court is directed to forthwith file and serve this Order on the attorneys of record.		
March 17, 2025	Argument Letter Sent		Superior Court of Pennsylvania
	Document Name: updated date		

Appeal Docket Sheet

Superior Court of Pennsylvania

Docket Number: 993 EDA 2024

Page 11 of 11

May 12, 2025



DOCKET ENTRY

Filed Date	Docket Entry / Representing	Participant Type	Filed By
March 17, 2025	Acknowledgement of Argument Notice Monsanto Company	Appellant	Hare, John Jacob
March 17, 2025	Acknowledgement of Argument Notice Caranci and Carmela Caranci, Ernest	Appellee	Becker, Charles Lyman
March 20, 2025	Acknowledgement of Argument Notice Monsanto Company	Appellant	Heim, Robert C.
Document Name: Acknowledgement of Notification of CHANGE in Oral Argument			
May 8, 2025	Affirmed		Dubow, Alice B.

SESSION INFORMATION

Journal Number: J-A06036-25
 Consideration Type: Argument Panel
 Listed/Submitted Date: March 27, 2025

Panel Composition:

The Honorable Anne E. Lazarus	President Judge
The Honorable Jack A. Panella	President Judge Emeritus
The Honorable Alice B. Dubow	Judge

DISPOSITION INFORMATION

Final Disposition:	Yes	Judgment Date:	May 8, 2025
Related Journal No:	J-A06036-25	Disposition Author:	Dubow, Alice B.
Category:	Decided	Disposition Date:	May 8, 2025
Disposition:	Affirmed	Filing Author:	Dubow, Alice B.
Dispositional Filing:	Opinion		
Filed Date:	5/8/2025 12:00:00AM		